DEBREMARKOS UNIVERSITY

SCHOOL OF LAW

SENIOR THESIS

TITLE: REFUGEES'RIGHT TO LIFE IN PUGNIDO REFUGEE CAMP Gambella, Ethiopia.

BY, Mai Mabil Luk

DEBREMARKOS

ETHIOPIA

December, 2016

A Thesis Submitted to the Debre markos University Faculty of Law Under Graduate Program in Partial Fulfilment of the Requirement for the Award of the Bachelor of Law (LL.B)

By: Mai Mabil Luk

Advisor: Mulugeta Nigusse (LL.B, LL.M)

Debremarkos University Ethiopia

December 2016

Declaration

I hereby declare that this paper of Senior Thesis is less than 13,000 words in length, it based only on the result of my personal research work, except for reference to the work of those people I have duly acknowledged. It is prepared under the supervision of my advisor instructor Mulugeta N.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I praise the creator of heaven and earth, for giving me the glorious time to accomplish this work of five years of L.L.B and thesis.

I would like to express my gladness to my advisor for his selfless advice to me during the preparation of this paper.

My sincere thanks goes to Assistant prof Mesganaw G for his tired less supply to me the hard copy, since had it not been his help, it would have been too difficult for me to complete this work within the time I have used.

I would like to take this opportunity to appreciate this Great and honest man, Mr Yohanes, director of junior and primary schools in Pugnido refugee camp for his voluntary and humanly support to me during my field observation in Pugnido refugee camp with different types of pens and papers a price of which could has been beyond my financial capacity.

I would also like to have this blessed time to express my gratitude to my colleague Nigus Zerefu, for his tired less in supporting me by printing my senior thesis proposal subsequently.

After all, iam hereby exhaling my deepest gratitude at the bottom of my heart to my brother Thoan Gatjuol Gach for his provision to me the machine that form the basis on the preparation of this paper.

To all of you dear fellow country men, your support to me in the year 2016 is unforgettable and therefore deserve more than those expressions.

Abstract

The right to life as one of the fundamental human rights is described as the most precious, inalienable & fundamental of all the fundamental rights of human being whose protection in turn ensure the enjoyment of others rights.

The purpose of this thesis is to evaluate and reveal the reality of the camp life for refugees in Pugnido refugee camp, specifically it is intended to reveal how the realization of the refugees' right to life in Pugnido refugee camp is? It also focus on other refugees' right whose violation result to violation of the right to life as well, namely, refugees' right to food, right to health, and the right to security of their persons. According to this paper, the factors that constitute the violation of the refugees' right to life in P.R.C are ascertained hereunder as the violation of the refugees' right to food, right to health & the right to security as well.

Right to life is generally appear to be susceptible to violation since though it may not be violated directly but indirectly, instance right to life is violated through supplies of insufficiencies food, health care, &security of persons, this act takes place mostly in developing world due to economic problem while bringing a number of children to this world. Besides, right to life is directly violated through sex selective abortion, infanticide, &the death penalty against juvenile offenders. With respective to refugees' right to life on which this research is dealing, refugees' right to life is mostly violated

negligently if not intentionally ,as it appear in different places that refugees were & are facing extra judicial execution due to lack of effective security, instance this action has taken place in D.R.C, Sudan,& in Gambella, Ethiopia. Moreover, refugees' right to life is violated through violation of their right to food, health & security of their persons, this violation is existing in various refugee camps, for example, it was revealed by 2014 UN report in Lebanon that Syrian refugees tend to have little /no access to sufficiency nutrition & health living conditions. On other hand, refugees are facing serious malnutrition & health problems, as well as lack of effective security in various refugee camps in Gambella, Ethiopia. These violation of the refugees' right to food may result to the exposure of refugees to various disease or to lose of life, where as violation of the right to health can directly lead a person to lose his/her life. After all, lack of effective security may expose the refugees to either body injured or simply to death.

ACRONYMS

- ACRWC African Charter on the right & Welfare of the Child
- ARRA Administration for Refugee and Returnee Affairs
- CEDAW Convention on Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination Against Women
- CERD Convention on Elimination of all forms of Racial Discrimination
- CRC Convention on the Right of the Child
- CPA Comprehensive peace agreement
- DRC Democratic Republic Congo
- ECOSOC Economic and Social Council
- ICESCR International Covenant on Economic, Social & Cultural Right

- ICCPR International Covenant on Civil & political Right
- IDP Internally Displaced Persons
- IRO International Refugee Organization
- MSF Medicine Saint Frontier
- P.R.C Pugnido Refugees Camp
- UDHR Universal Declaration of Human Rights
- UNGA United Nation General Assembly
- UNHCR United Nation High Commissioner for Refugee
- UN United Nations
- UNRRA United Nation Relief and Rehabilitation Administration
- WFP World Food Programme

Definition of key terms

- ADEth :in Nuer language Mean pulse(types of beans use as stew) (wot in Amharic)
- Asylum: Mean is a safe/inviolable place
- Asylum seekers: Mean a person who, from fear of prosecution, has crossed an international frontier into a country in which he/she hopes to be granted refugee status.
- BEl in Nuer Language: Mean Grains
- Dhet in Nuer language: Mean Oil
- Health: Mean the state of being bodily and mentally vigorous and free from disease.

- KadE in Nuer language: Mean Salt
- Life:Mean the fullest opportunity to develop one's personality to the highest level possible in the existing stage of our civilization.
- Nup in Nuer language:Mean Supplementary/Nutritional Food
- Ration:Mean fixed allowance of food.
- Refugee:Mean a person is outside his/her country of nationality/habitual residence and is unable /unwilling to return to his/her country of origin due to well –founded fear of prosecution on ground of race, religion, nationality, political opinion/membership in particular social group**.**
- . Refugees Camp:Mean Temporary settlement for the reception of refugees
- Refugee law:Mean the branch of international law which deal with the rights and protection of refugees.
- Right to Life:Mean is the most precious, inalienable and fundamental of all the fundamental rights of human being.
- Thoker in Nuer language:Mean Sugar

Contents page

Declaration.....ii
Acknowledgements.....iii
Abstract.....iv
ACRONYMS.....v
Definition of key terms.....vi

CHAPTER ONE....1
1.1INTERDUCTION....1
1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY....3
1.3 STATMENT OF PROBLEM....6
1.4RESEARCH QUESTIONS....6
1.4.1Main question....6
1.4.2Sub-questions....6
1.5 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF STUDY....6
1.5.1AIM OF STUDY....6
1.5.2OBJECTIVE OF STUDY....6
1.6 SCOPE OF STUDY....7
1.7SIGNIFICANCE OF STUDY....7
1.8 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY....7
1.8.1RESEARCH APPROACH....7
1.8.2POPULATIONS AND SAMPLING....7
1.8.3Instrumentation and data collection techniques....8
1.8.4DATA ANALYSIS TECHNIQUES....8
1.9RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY OF RESEARCH....8
1.10 Ethical considerations....8
CHAPTER TWO....9
2. CONCEPTUAL UNDERSTANDING OF THE RIGHT TO LIFE....9
2.1Definitions....9
2.2RIGHT TO LIFE IN GENERAL....9
2.2.1RIGHT TO LIFE IN INTERNATIONAL DOCUMENTS....10
2.2.2RIGHT TO LIFE AT REGIONAL INSTRUMENTS....10
2.2.3 Right to Life in National context....11
2.3 Refugees' Right to Life....12
2.4 Rights Which Have Direct Bearing to the Right to Life....14
2.4.1Right to Food....14
2.4.2Right to Health....16
2.4.3Right to Security....18
CHAPTER THREE....20
3. THE RIGHT TO LIFE IN PUGNIDO REFUGEES' CAMP....20

3.1 INTRODUCTION.....20
3.2THE RIGHT TO LIFE IN Pugnido Refugees Camp.....20
3.3 Right to food, health & security of person.....22
3.3.1The Right to food in Pugnido Refugee Camp.....22
3.3.2The right to health in Pugnido Refugee Camp.....24
3.3.3The right to security in Pugnido Refugee Camp.....25
CHAPTER FOUR.....27
4.FINDING, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION.....27
4.1Findings.....27
4.2 Conclusion.....28
4.3Recommendation.....29
Bibliography.....30
Interviewees.....34
Annex.....35

CHAPTER ONE

1.1INTERDUCTION

The discourse on human right may be a relative modern creation, but the idea underpin it can be traced back at least, to classic if not before that, indeed most ancient religions included a codes of practice which might be interpreted as to implies certain rights, but their limitation is that they were largely stratified, besides ancient and classical philosophers had also contributed to the discourse, for instance, the concept of enlightenment allowed for a renewal of secular moral universalism and therefore, it is from these roots that we can trace the evolution of the idea of human rights that is recognized today.[1]

However, prior to the formation of UN Charter, individuals were not a major concern of international law in that there was little in the rules as to their protection save those of combatants and civilian who were receiving protection at the time of war, so that individuals were left helpless so as to seek their protection only through national laws, this perception has been radically changed after the formation of UN Charter where the protection of individual's human rights and right to life specifically become the primary focus to reaffirm a faith in fundamental human rights, and the right to life in particular, the dignity, and worth of human person, notably UN Charter ensure the commitment of the organization to promote ,among others , a universal respect for and observance of human rights and the right to life in single term without distinction of any ground as the result, the same Charter put the states under obligation to take practical steps for the protection of human rights.[2]

[1] Darren O'Byrne, Human rights on introduction,(2003) Pearson education limited, New Delhi, India p.28

[2] Martin Dixon,4th ed (,2000) text book on international law, Oxford University press, p.328

Although UN charter has voiced the commitment to recognize and to protect the human rights in general and the individual's right to life in particular, most states reluct on implementation of this commitment, except European union that ensure the commitment to protect human rights and the right to life in particular as it is discussed in chapter two.[3]

Children's right to life is one of a fundamental human rights acknowledged under almost all international treaties relating to human rights, nonetheless, practically children are losing their lives every day, this may indicates that right to life is not protected effectively in many countries as it appear that millions of children are killed yearly with impunity for the perpetrators instance through sex selective abortion and infanticide, and the death against juvenile offenders, these acts are practically practiced in India, china and Japan where boys are given preference over girls due to traditional influence that consequently generates worrying behaviors in that parents intentionally eliminate unborn baby girls through abortion and even already born girls are also eliminated via infanticide, as result of the proliferation of those forbidden practice, such as sex selective abortion and infanticide, it appear that there is a deficiency of more than one million women in Asia.[4]

This paper is arranged with into four chapters, where chapter one deal with the explanations of the historical development of human right in general and the right to life in particular, as well as the historical development on the protection of the refugees' right to life.

Chapter two, focus on the demonstration of the conceptual understanding of the right to life in general and the refugees' right to life in Pugnido Refugee Camp in particular with their associated rights, namely right to food, right

[3] Id p.342 & 343
[4] Right to life in the world/humanism-together for children's right to life, see www.humanism.org/.../right- to- life/accessed on Nov 26- 2016

health, and the right to security in different instruments ranging from international, regional and national instruments.

Whereas Chapter three present the reality of the camp life for the refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp based on the implementation of the refugees' right to life, right to food, right to health and the right to security.

Chapter four concludes the over all discussions of this thesis with the findings, conclusion, recommendations, bibliography and some annex collected from Pugnido Refugee Camp.

1.2 BACKGROUND OF THE STUDY

Refugees have existed as history, but an awareness of the responsibility of the international community to provide protection and find a solution for refugees problem dates only from the time of the league of nation and the election of D.r Fridtjof Nansen as the first high commissioner for Russian refugees in 1921.[5]

Following the demise of the League of Nations and the formation of united nation, the international community was acutely aware of the refugee crisis following the end of World War II, then, in 1947, the international refugees organization (IRO) was created by the united nations as the first international agency to deal comprehensively with all aspects pertaining to refugees live in Europe in the aftermath of world war II, and was to be terminated by June 30, 1950.[6]

[5]Erika feller, the evolution of the international refugees' protection regime. see https://www.law.wustle.edu/haris/document/p129-feller.pdf accessed on Nov 2- 2016

[6] United Nation High Commissioner for refugees. see http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/united-nation-high-commissioner-for-refugee accessed on 3-11-2016

This paragraph has demonstrated that the protection of refugee at the then period was not globalized since the protection of refugee was focusing only in Europe or Asia instead of the world as a whole.

In December 1949, the general assembly decided to replace the IRO with UNHCR for the period of three years, but has been subsequently broadened, as the former was expensive and the fact that it was caught up in politics of the cold war.[7]

Whereas the history of protection of refugees dates back at least a few centuries, not to mention refugees' situations before the protection date, the history of international protection of refugees started with the league of nation, no one would be surprised to learn that the international committee of the Red Cross was the initiator of the international protection of refugees set up by the league of nation.[8]

Though states have been granting protection to individual and group fleeing prosecution for centuries, the modern refugees' regime is largely the product of the second half of the twentieth century, like international human rights law modern refugees law has its origin in the aftermath of the world war II as well as the refugees crisis of the interwar years that preceded it.[9]

As man made disasters are also the main cause that forces people out from their homes, international refugees' law where applicable can contribute to protect human rights in emergence situations including the right to adequate food.[10]

---

[7] ibid

[8] International committee of the red cross, http://www.icrc.org/eng/asset/files/other/728-738-jaeger.pdf accessed on OCT 29-20166

[9]Asylum and the right of refugees/international justice resource center see http://www.ijrcenter.org/refugee law/accessed on Oct 28-2016

[10] Refugee law & guiding principles on internal displacement, http:// www.unhcr.org/international-refugee- agency. accessed on OCT 30-2016

International law and practice address refugees and internal displacement emergencies differently, since refugee are not citizens of the country of asylum and therefore, have specific protection need as the status of being a refugee is of vulnerability in itself.[11] Usually, across the world, people make difficult decision to leaves their homes, families, possessions and connection with their local communities and walk away to an uncertain and often frightening future elsewhere.[12]

According to this statement, the term refugee is not a desired title by the people in that they use it as the last option to save their life from physically existing danger that may lead to serious violation of their God given rights.

As refugees leave their homes suddenly for safety of theirs/their families life to unknown areas, they face various conditions and challenges amongst others, refugees may spent many days along the way with a little food if any, suffering of various diseases and fear for safety of their life/sometimes may also spent much time in detention (mostly in European countries, Greece).[13]

Since we become familiar about conditions facing the refugees on their ways as asylum seekers to protection areas, it's a time to have a look at the reality of the camp life for refugees, among others, refugees may face insufficiency of food and chronic malnutrition that make refugees more vulnerable to various diseases, look, though UNHCR recommended it that each refugee have to receive more than 2,100 calories per day this sometime is not followed by administrations of refugee as it appear in Tanzanian refugees camp refugees were found receiving only 1,700/1,460

[11]United Nation High Commissioner for refugees seehttp://www.unhcr.org/54f6b129.pdf accessed on OCT 27-2016
[12] Refugees-Global footprints see https:www.globalfootprints.org/refugees. Visited on wed-09-11-2016
[13] ibid

calories per day, this condition may also happen in Ethiopian refugees camp.[14]

Therefore, this paragraph has revealed that living in refugees' camp after recognition as a refugee is not a bed of Rose, meaning that refugees may also face challenges in camp.

Besides, a joint review conducted by UNHCR and WFP has also revealed unaccepted rate of extreme malnutrition in refugee camps, instance in Kenya, Ethiopia and Sudan, even though refugees were found receiving the recommended amount, but lack of food variety also causes many refugees to suffer from deficiencies which on other hand expose them to variety of disease.[15] Based on the above indicated facts, the latter statement show that refugees are facing two types of diseases, namely malnutrition, caused due to insufficiency of food, and malaria.

Refugees from Sudan have been settled in Ethiopia's Gambella region since 1984. Besides, the recent outbreak of civil war in the South Sudan has also triggered the outflow of asylum seekers from South Sudan to Ethiopia with the total population of about 310,864 in combination with the existed refugees population, whose male and female population is 43.7 & 56.3 percent respectively and is categorized into five camps i.e. pugnido I, tierkidi, kule, jewi and pugnido II, where pugnido I, the area of my research hosting the largest refugees' population of 63,527 peoples. [16]

Practically, refugees are facing serious malnutrition problem in kule, jewi/lietchuor &suffering of malaria, measles,& cholera Gambella e.[17]

---

[14] Module3: food, water, sanitation,& housing in refugees camps see www.uniteforsight.org/refugee-health/module3,visited on Friday 11-11-2016

[15] ibid

[16] South Sudan situation-Ethiopia-Gambella, see http://www.data.unhcr.org/south Sudan/region, php?id=36 and country=65 accessed on Oct 30-2016

[17] Natalie Robert, Medicine Saint Frontier(MSF) Medical Coordinator in Gambella for Refugees, Ethiopia: critical conditions for south Sudanese refugees in Gambella, see at www.msf.org/en/articles/Ethiopia-critical-conditions-south Sudanese refugees-Gambella, accessed on Dec 02-2016

1.3 STATMENT OF PROBLEM

The fact that refugees' right to life is susceptible to violation as it had happen in Sudan that government force attacked the internally displaced persons (IDP) in Darfur, and in D.R.C, Rwandan refugees were attacked in front of their protection force, besides it has also revealed that refugees are facing acute malnutrition in kule, jewi/lietchuor camp in Gambella Ethiopia & suffering of malaria, measles & cholera. Pugnido as a refugee's camp may not be free from those challenges. In these conditions, though there were some persons who have conducted a researches on refugees' rights, none of them has focused on the refugees' right to life in a specific term. Instance, Eyram Kadogbe has conducted a research on the refugees' right to food in Ampain Refugee Camp in Ghana. While Mewded Mengesha has also conducted a research on human right violation in Pugnido Refugees Camp. As the result, the realization of the refugees' right to life in Pugnido Refugees Camp in a specific term is worth researchable. Therefore, the researcher is here by proposed the following research questions:

1.4RESEARCH QUESTIONS

1.4.1Main question

The main research question of this study is to investigate whether there is violation of the right to life in Pugnido Refugees Camp?

1.4.2Sub-questions

1. Is there violation of the right to life in pugnido refugees' camp?
2. What constitute the violation of the right to life in pugnido refugees'?

1.5 AIM AND OBJECTIVES OF STUDY

1.5.1AIM OF STUDY

The aim of this study is to ascertain the realization of the refugees' rights to life in pugnido refugees camp

1.5.2OBJECTIVE OF STUDY

- **General objective**

The general objective of this study is to explore the factors that constitute the violation of right to life in pugnido refugees' camp

- **Specific objectives**
  - To evaluate the practical implementation of refugees' right to life in Pugnido Refugee Camp
  - To assess the implementation of right to food in Pugnido Refugee Camp
  - To investigate the protection of the right to health in Pugnido Refugee Camp
  - To examine the effectiveness of security in Pugnido Refugee Camp

1.6 SCOPE OF STUDY

The scope of this study is limited to the rights of refugees to life specifically in pugnido refugee camp.

1.7SIGNIFICANCE OF STUDY

1. This study will reveal the discrepancies which exist between the law and practice regarding the rights to life in pugnido refugees camp.
2. It will enable the human rights organizations to understand the reality of the camp life for refugees.
3. It will enable the refugee to live a human life that can restore their human dignity and happiness to the possible extent

1.8 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In answering the research questions indicated above, the researcher has employed a narrative analysis research methodology. Besides, the researcher has did a field observation to know the reality of camp life for refugees and to this effect the researcher has employed to this study the qualitative research methodology as the researcher has utilize the theoretical means of data presentation.

1.8.1RESEARCH APPROACH

To this research a qualitative research approach was employed to analyse the empirical data in line with the legal stipulation of the law

1.8.2POPULATIONS AND SAMPLING

In this research, the population were the camp coordinators, protections officers, camp chairman and heads of health center, as well as officials of concern worldwide. The researcher has employed the purposive sampling technique with intent to reduce the cost in time and other resources, and to get convenience and relevant data from refugees community as well.

1.8.3Instrumentation and data collection techniques

TO this research, the researcher has used pens and papers and conducted the interview i.e. both structured and semi structured as well as field observation too; in addition to this, the researcher has used both primary and secondary sources.

1.8.4DATA ANALYSIS TECHNIQUES

As to the data analysis techniques, the researcher has employed narrative descriptive techniques as it was in line with the objective of the research.

1.9RELIABILITY AND VALIDITY OF RESEARCH

Regarding reliability, this research has been accompanied with various sources. For conformity, the researcher has tried to comply with all the formal procedures of legal research as much as possible.

1.10 Ethical considerations

I have secured the permission from Debremarkos's School of Law, Administration for Refugee and Returnees Affairs in Pugnido and local administration with in the camp, I have also assured my respondents regarding the purpose of collecting the data so that I have obtain these data based on their voluntary expression . After all I have informed my respondents that they do have the right not to reply the question as they wish, and that their response should be used only for Academic purpose, as well as their identity shall not be revealed.

CHAPTER TWO

2. CONCEPTUAL UNDERSTANDING OF THE RIGHT TO LIFE

2.1Definitions

The right to life is defined as the most precious, sacrosanct, and inalienable and fundamental of all the fundamental rights of human being;[18] Right to life as one of the fundamental human rights that has

[18] Sunil Deshta, & Kiran Deshta,2nd ed,(2007),fundamental human rights, faculty of law, H.P .University, Shimla, New Delhi, p.1

got recognition from various instruments, has a varieties of definitions, for example, It is defined as the fullest opportunity to develop one's personality & potentiality to the highest level possible in the existing stage of our civilization.[19] Based on these definitions, it appears that right to life does focus not only on protection of being killed rather it covers the right to be protected from all circumstances which may affect the right to life.

Furthermore, right to life is also defined as a moral principle that based on the believe that human being has the right to live & in particular should not be killed by another human being.[20] According to this definition, human right to life seems to be protected only from the direct action of another human being to deprive person from his right to life, but what about indirect action of one against another? Could that not amount to the violation of human right to life? On my point of view, this definition has opened a room for violation of human right to life indirectly. After all, right to life is described as the right of every person to have his life respected & protected by the law & in general from the moment of conception to death.[21]

2.2RIGHT TO LIFE IN GENERAL

Diverse literatures have recognized & incorporated the right to life as a fundamental right of human being, & therefore recommended the effective practical implementation & protection of it in any circumstances & at any place with no distinction of any ground.

2.2.1RIGHT TO LIFE IN INTERNATIONAL DOCUMENTS

Globally, after WWII, the main focus was shifted to the recognition & protection of individual's human right in general & right to life in particular,

[19] Id p.64
[20] Right to life-Wikipedia, see http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/right-to-life,accessed on Nov 13-2016
[21] Janusz Symonides,(2003)human right: international protection, monitoring & enforcement, University of Warsaw, Poland,p.170

based on international shift, in 1948,UDHR was declared &under this international instrument right of every one to life, liberty & security of person has been incorporated.[22]

Moreover, right to life has its legal foundation in 1966 international covenant on civil & political right that enshrined the inherent right to life of every human being & ensure its protection by the law, besides its 2nd optional protocol ensured that no person within the jurisdiction of the state party to it shall be executed.[23] According to this 2nd optional protocol, death penalty is abolished with the aims to save the life.

In 1989, the state parties had recognized the inherent right of every one to life under convention on the right of the child, with the same token, state parties reaffirm the inherent right of every human being to life with all necessary measures to ensure its effective enjoyment by person with disabilities on an equal basis with others.[24]

2.2.2RIGHT TO LIFE AT REGIONAL INSTRUMENTS

The conceptual understanding of the right to life is also incorporated under regional instruments, example, the right of every one to life shall be protected by the law, in that no one shall be deprived from his right to life intentionally, save in the execution of sentence provided by the law.[25] .Likewise, it is also reaffirmed under the charter of fundamental rights of European union,2000 that everyone has the right to life & no one shall be condemned to death penalty.[26]

---

[22] Art 3 of the 1948 Universal Declaration of Human right, adopted by UNGA on December 10,1948,GA Res,217A(III)

[23] Art 6 of the 1966 international covenant on civil & political right,(ICCPR),& Art 1 of its 2nd optional protocol,1989.

[24] Art 6 of the 1989 United Nation convention on the right of the child ,adopted on Nov 20,1989,entered into force on Sept 2,1990,GA Res.44/25,& Art 10 of the 2007 convention on the right of persons with disabilities

[25] Art 2 of the 1950 council of Europe's convention for the protection of all human rights & fundamental freedom(ETS,NO.5)

[26] Art 2 of the 2000 charter of the fundamental rights of European union

Right to life has also its legal foundation in African charter on human & people's right that stipulated that human being is inviolable, & therefore shall be entitled to the respect for his life & the integrity of his person.[27] As far as the concept of the equality is concerned between men & women, the concept of the right to life is also enshrined under protocol to the African charter on human & people's right on the right of women in Africa that every women shall be entitled to respect for her life, the integrity & security of her person.[28]

In the like manner, the right of the child to the inherent right to life is also incorporated under the African charter on the right & welfare of the child, & according to this charter, this right of the child to life shall be protected by the law so that state parties to this charter shall ensure the maximum extent possible to the survival, protection &development of the child.[29]

The legal basis on the concept of the right to life is also indicated with in American declaration where the right of every human being to the right to life, liberty & security of his person is made as the fundamental of the declaration.[30] **W**ith the same token, right to life has also its origin in American convention on human right, San Jose, Costa Rica, 1969. In accordance with the Arab charter, every individual has the right to life, liberty,& security of his person that shall protected by the law.[31]

2.2.3 Right to Life in National context

Regarding the conceptual understanding of the right to life at home, in Ethiopian context, right to life is clearly enshrined within the text of the Federal Democratic Republic Ethiopia constitution that every person has

[27] Art 4 of the 1981 African charter on human & people's right, Nairobi, Kenya
[28] Art 4 of the 2003 protocol to the African charter on human & people's right on the right of women in Africa, Maputo, Mozambique
[29] Art 5 of the 1990 African charter on the right & welfare of the child(ACWC)
[30] Art 1 of the 1948 American declaration of the right & duties of man, Bogota, Colombia.
[31] Art 5 of the 1994 Arab Charter on Human Rights, Cairo, Egypt.

the right to life in that no person shall be deprived of his life save as punishment for serious criminal offence determined by the law.[32]

Moreover, right to life as the basic fundamental human right of every person is also stated by some Ethiopian writers in their book, based on their statement every person should acquire the right to life along with its legal protection, for the sole reason that he is a human being.[33]

2.3 Refugees' Right to Life

Before discussing the refugees' right to life, it would be better to have a look first on the definition of refugee:

Refugee as a term is defined as a person who is outside his/her country of nationality/habitual resident, owing to well founded fear of persecution on ground of his race, religion, nationality, membership of particular social group/political opinion & is unwilling/unable to return to his country of origin.[34]

According to this definition, for a person to be received & resettled as refugee, he should be out of his country of origin due to real ground that endanger his life, he should also be unwilling/unable to return home as the result of that identified fear of his life.

This definition was extended under 1984 Cartagena declaration & OAU convention governing the specific aspect of refugee in Africa:

In accordance with Cartagena declaration, refugee is defined as a person who flee his country since his life, safety/freedom has been threatened due to generalized violence, foreign aggression, international conflict, massive violation of human rights/other circumstances which have seriously

[32] Art 15 of the constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, proclamation no.1/1995,Federal Negarit Gazeta, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
[33] Girmachew Alemu, Yonas Bermeta, & Wondemagegn Tadesse, Ethiopian human right, 2003,school of law & center for human right, Addis Ababa University, p.49
[34] Art 1A(2) of the UN 1951 convention relating to the refugees status,UN 1967 protocol relating to the status of refugee,adopted by the UNGA in Res.2198(XXI)

disturbed public order; whereas in case of OAU convention governing the specific aspect of refugee in Africa, refugee is described as any person compelled to leave his country owing to external aggression, occupation ,foreign domination/event seriously disturbing the public order in either part or whole of his country of origin.[35]

On other hand, refugee is also defined under Ethiopia's refugee proclamation no 409/2004 as a person owing to a well-founded fear of being persecuted for the reason of race, religion, nationality, membership of particular social group/political opinion/ having no nationality/ owing to external aggression, occupation, foreign domination/event seriously disturbing public order in either part/whole of his country of origin & compelled to leave/is outside his country & is unwilling/unable to return/avail himself of the protection of that country.[36]

Refugees as human being are not excluded from the right to life recognized & incorporated under international, regional & national level in favor of human being in general, in that they enjoy those entitlements based on their humanity since right to life is for every person. Yet, specifically in special cases, refugees are granted with their own right to life at certain circumstances, though there are no clear & pertinent provisions, on other ways we may apply those provisions which concerned for protection of refugee; instance:

According to 1951 convention relating to the refugee status, a person is considered as refugee & granted with protection in other country to save his life, not only that the rationale behind non refoulement principle under ART 33 of the same convention is also to save the life of refugee,& as such is also serve as the provisions dealing with the refugees' right to life.[37]

[35] Art 3 of the 1984 Cartagena Declaration, & Art 1 (1),(2) of the 1969 organization of African union convention governing the specific aspect of the refugees in Africa
[36] Art 2 (7) & Art 4 of the refugee proclamation no 409/2004,Addis Ababa, Ethiopia
[37] Supra at note 33, Art 33

In the same manner, Art1 of OAU convention governing the specific aspect of refugees in Africa define the term refugee by taking into consideration the circumstances which may entail the violation of the right to life .Based on that, this provision may also be cited as focusing on the refugees' right to life, besides, the African charter on the right & welfare of the child that stipulated in general term that refugees children shall benefit from all rights granted to the child under this charter, this make the refugee children to benefit directly from ART 5 of this charter that deal with the right to life of the child.[38]

With the same language, ART 22 of the CRC has also enshrined the right of refugee children to enjoy all the rights guaranteed for the child under this convention which directly would enable the refugee children to be beneficiaries of ART 6 of this convention that focus on the child's right to life in general, so this provision by virtue of ART 22, shall be apply to the refugees' right to life.[39]

Ethiopia as a signatory to both international & regional instruments on protection of refugees & to secure the proper implementation of those instruments to the refugees under its custody, the country has enacted & proclaimed a laws in 2004 on refugee status & protection, cited as refugee proclamation no 409/2004,& under this proclamation, the principle of non refoulement is also incorporated which, as that of ART 33 of the 1951 convention, deal on protection of refugees' right to life.[40]

2.4 Rights Which Have Direct Bearing to the Right to Life

By taking into consideration the nature of human rights in general that is Universal, indivisible, interdependent & interrelated, violation of one of them, though there may be effective protection of others, may also amount

[38] Supra at notes 28 & 34, Art 23
[39] Supra at note 23, Art 22
[40] Supra at note 35,Art 9

to violation of those protected rights.[41] Based on that, right to life is to be protected in connection to the following human rights among others:

2.4.1Right to Food

This right is considered as one of the oldest international policies recognized as an integral component of human rights because food is essential to life & provides not only the basic sustenance for physical survival & nutrition for healthy human existence but make the key element of people's culture. [42]

Right to food, according the UN special rapporteur on the right to food in 2002, defined the right to food as the right to have regular, permanent an restricted, either by directly or by mean of financial purchase to quantitatively and qualitatively adequate and sufficient food corresponding to the cultural tradition of people to which the consumer belong and which insured a physical and mental, individual and collective, fulfilling and dignified life free of fear.[43]

Right to meals (food) and nourishment is also considered as essential right for all human being due to fact that food is an essential element of life, without which human being may not survive and as such is recognized as the right of each and every men , women /child to a guaranteed access to health food on a regular basis.[44] Based on this conceptual understanding of the right to food, food is needed to be available, meaning that it must be sufficient in quantity and quality for entire population, on other hand it must be accessible that is each person must be able to procure nourishment either through his direct production or through supply of food, generally the

[41] Mulugeta Nigussie, lecture note on human rights,2016.
[42] Debebe Hailegebriel law office,2015,ensuring fundamental rights, the right to food, freedom of expression, access to information & reproductive health, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, p.11 & 23
[43] Jean Ziegler(2002),United Nation special rapporteur on the right to food, see www.fao.org/right-to-food/about-right to food/en, accessed on Oct 21-2016
[44] ibid

food must be available and accessible under all circumstances as well as it must be health[45] .

Recently , right to food is recognized under various international, regional and national instruments of human right, however, the actual realisation of this recognized right remain in question, mostly in third world countries due to socio-economic problem.[46]

In accordance with the latter paragraph, food security is existed in developed world so that people experience no difficulty regarding the availability and accessibility of food they need, conversely, in developing world many children suffer from malnutrition as family may possess no means enough to alleviate the hunger or vary their food, this consequently may lead to their exposure to serious illness.

The right to adequate food as human right was formally recognised by the UN in the following international documents .For instance everyone is granted with right standard of living adequate for health and well being of himself and his family, including food among others and of livelihood in circumstance beyond is control.[47]

Besides, the 2001 African commission on human and people's right recognized the right to food and stated that it fall under the African charter on human and people's right, this interpretation has also reaffirmed under 2003, protocol to African charter on human and people's right on the right of women in Africa.[48]

As the common issue that need a global attention, right to food is incorporated under ICESCR by stating that state parties to the present covenant recognize the right of every one to adequate food, likewise, under

[45] Understanding children's right to food/humanism-together for children's rights, see www.humanism.org/en/fundamental-rights/food/, accessed on Nov 21-2016
[46] Misganaw Gashaw, food as human right: the frontier of the Ethiopian government obligation, Debremarkos University, p.1
[47] Supra at note 21,Art 25
[48] Supra at note 27,Art 15

the CRC 1989, state parties also have recognized the right of every child to standard of living adequate for child's physical, mental, spiritual and social development.[49]

Whereas, right of person with disabilities to an adequate standard of living for themselves and their families including adequate food has also received a recognition with full commitment from state parties to the convention on the right of person with disabilities.[50]

Right of women to have nutritious and adequate food has got its foundation under protocol to African charter on human and people's right on the right of women in Africa and added that the enjoyment and realization of this shall be ensure by the state parties.[51]

The right of everyone to adequate nutrition which guaranteed the possibility of enjoying the highest level of physical, emotional and intellectual development has also got its legal basis under additional protocol to American convention on human right in area of economic, social and cultural right.[52]

As to the generality of the above indicated provisions regarding the guarantee & incorporation of the right of every one to food, this term every person grant the right to food to every human. Therefore, the generality of these provisions enable also the refugee to enjoy this right to food based on their humanity.

2.4.2Right to Health

The concept of the right to health as the issue that touch the fundamental point of human life is defined through various ways; first and foremost, it is

[49] Art 11 of the UN 1976 International Covenant on Economic Social & Cultural Right, adopted on December 16, 1966,entered into force on January 3,1976,GA Res.2200 A(XXI),& Art 27 of the UN 1990 Convention on the Right of the Child, adopted on November 20,19989,entry into force on Sept 2,1990,GA Res.44/25

[50] Supra at note 23,Art 28

[51] Supra at note 27,Art 15

[52] See Art 12 of the 1988 additional protocol to the American convention on human right in areas of economic, social & cultural right, San Salvador, El Salvador

defined as the state of being sound /whole in body, mind/ soul, the same token has been louder accordingly World Health Organization (WHO) stated that health is not just the absent of disease, it is a state of complete physical, mental and social well being.[53]

On the same concept, some writers have added their points of arguments that right to life and personal liberty would be meaningless unless medical care is assured to sick/unhealthy persons as it may be essential for the preservation of the life.[54] According to this statement, though the right to life is protected effectively while we go against other human rights, notably right to health, we are indirectly going against the right to life, as it is obvious that health problem is also one of the cause for the loss of one's life, therefore medication aid is needed timely all the time.

That point of arguments is also reaffirmed here under, by showing that health as a vitally important for every human being globally, its realization put an obligation to each country to facilitate and ensure health services which are available in a circumstance, accessible to everyone of good quality and satisfactory to everyone.[55]

Right to health has clearly acquire its legal foundation through variety of international, regional and national documents indicated hereunder ,instance the right of every person to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of physical and mental health is enshrined under ICESCR. and through interpretation, the committee under general comment no 14 have also emphasize the essentiality and interrelated element which state parties to the ICESCR should apply while dealing with their obligation indicated under ART 12 of the international document (ICESCR) mentioned in this paragraph as to includes, among others, the availability, accessibility, acceptability and quality of health services.[56]

[53] Byrne A. Garner,8th ed, Black's law dictionary, USA, p.737
[54] Supra at note 17
[55] Supra at note 42
[56] Supra at note 46,Art 12,& Art 3 of the General comment 14

On other hand, the obligation of the state parties to CEDAW, to take all appropriate measure to eliminate discrimination against women in the field of health care so as to ensure, taking into consideration the basis of equality between men and women, access to health care services which includes those services related to family planning, which also serves as a legal authority for women's right to health is incorporated under cedaw.[57]

As the fact which indicated that , even if the realization of the right to health may not be secure as possible, it may not be attributed to the insufficiency of the legal foundation of the indicated right /right to health, the states' acceptance and obligation to recognize that persons with disabilities have the right to the enjoyment of the highest attainable standard of health, in that state parties shall apply all necessary measures to ensure access for the person with disabilities to health services is also placed under convention on the right of a person with disabilities.[58]

Whereas the duty of government to ensure that adequate health services are made available to the indigenous and tribal people or the government shall provide them with the resources enough to enable them to design and deliver the health services under their own responsibility and control so that they would enjoy the highest attainable standard of physical and mental enshrined under the convention on the right of the indigenous and tribal people.[59]

Likewise, it is also guaranteed under maternity protection convention that each member of this convention shall after consulting the representative of organization of the employers and workers, adopt appropriate measure to ensure that pregnant/breastfeeding women would not be obligated to perform works that has been determined by the competent authority to be

[57] Art 12 of the convention on elimination of all form of discrimination against women(cedaw),1979
[58] Supra at note 23, Art 25 (2007)
[59] Art 25 of the 1989 convention on the right of indigenous & tribal people (no,169)

prejudicial to the health of the mother/child or where an assessment has established a significance risk to the mother/that of her child.[60]

On other hand, the legal basis of the child right to health is founded under African charter on the right and welfare of the child that every child shall have the right to enjoy the best attainable state of physical, mental and spiritual health so that for its realization, state parties to this charter shall undertake to ensure the provision of necessary medical assistance and health care to all children to with the emphasis on the development of primary health care.[61]

Right of every one to health is understood to means the enjoyment of the highest level of physical, mental and social well-being whose exercise requires the availability of the primary health care that is essential to all individuals and family in the community.[62]

2.4.3Right to Security

We almost reached the 3rd and the last category of the rights which among others have direct bearing with the right to life according to the scope of this paper, then to discuss the right to security it may be stepping stone to begin it with conceptual/working definition, like others human rights which we had discussed beginning from the inception of this chapter, right to security is one of the fundamental human right whose observance is worth noting and as such it has also its foundation in a diverse literatures.

Right to security is defined as the state of being under legal guarantee/being secured.[63] Regarding its legal basis, right to security is located within the text of UDHR that guaranteed the right of every one to life, liberty and security of person.[64]

---

[60] Art 3 of the 2000 maternity protection convention (no,183),Geneva
[61] Supra at note 28, Art 14(1990)
[62] Supra at note 49
[63] Supra at note 50
[64] Supra at note 21

On other hand, right to security can also be traced to the document of the ICCPR where it is guaranteed in combination with the right to liberty which also seem sound since for an individual to exercise his freedom of movement; existence of guaranteed security is the prerequisite most of the time.[65]

Furthermore, right to security has also been recognized under the convention on the right of person with disabilities that mandatorily require the state parties to it, to ensure that person with disabilities enjoy the right to liberty and security of the person on an equal basis with others normal persons.[66]

Besides, regarding the legal foundation of the right to security, African charter on human and people's right may also be cited for it has incorporated the right of every individual to liberty and to security of his person.[67]

Not only those indicated legal basis for the right to security of person are recognized, the same right to security is also recognized and protected by state against violation /bodily harm on individual whether inflicted by government officials or by an individual's group/ institution.[68]

Furthermore, the right of every one to the protection against body harm is also recognizes & incorporated under FDRE constitution. According to this provision, every person shall be protected against body harm, this provision, based on its wording imposed an obligation on state to effectively respect & protect this legally guaranteed right.[69]

[65] Supra at note 22, Art 9
[66] Supra at note 23, Art 14
[67] Supra at note 26,Art 6
[68] Art 5 (b) of the 1965 international convention on the elimination of all forms of racial discrimination(CERD)
[69] Supra at note 32, Art 16

CHAPTER THREE

3. THE RIGHT TO LIFE IN PUGNIDO REFUGEES' CAMP

At the beginning of chapter one the historical development of the human right in general and the right to life in particular, as well as the historical origin regarding the protection of refugee and the challenges facing them were discussed. Furthermore, conceptual understanding of the right to life in general and the refugees' right to life in particular as well as its associate rights such as the right to food, health and the right to security were also discussed under chapter two. Therefore this chapter is focusing on presentation of the result of the study, but before that a brief introduction is presented hereunder.

3.1 INTRODUCTION

Ethiopia as the Africa's oldest independent country located in the horn of Africa as well as is free from colonial rule in Africa, has overtaken Kenya and therefore become the Africa's largest refugee hosting country.[70]

The country started the reception of refugees from her sister country Sudan since 1984, whose cause of inflow to Ethiopia was attributed to the outbreak of the deadly and the longest civil war in east Africa as a region, and indeed in Africa as a continent triggered in 1955, one year before the independent of Sudan, then such a refugees had fleeded unrest in Ethiopia in may 1991 and settled at the border towns of Sudan and Ethiopia, but after the calm of unrest in Ethiopia, these refugees came back to Ethiopia

[70] Ethiopia, the world fact book-central intelligence Agency, see http://www.cia.gov/library/publication/the -world-fact book/goes/e, accessed on Dec 01-2016

and restablished those closed camps including Pugnido Refugees Camp in 1992.[71]

3.2THE RIGHT TO LIFE IN Pugnido Refugees Camp

Here the question I committed myself to answer were: is there violation of the right to life in Pugnido Refugees Camp? And if any, what constitute the violation of the right to life in Pugnido Refugees Camp? To answer those questions, I have started with the success of administration for refugee and returnees affair in that as per the legal stipulation of international and regional instruments on legal framework regarding how refugees camps are allocated in far place to the border towns of their country of origin, refugees have also been served properly with due diligence up to 2000, besides from 2000 up to date, they received a sufficiency supply of clean drinking water.[72]

When the things started going worse with the refugees in the early 2002, 32 passengers of refugees from Gambella town to Pugnido Refugees Camp were collected out from buses in Abobo town of the Anywak Zone and executed.[73] The reason was that those individuals refugees were from ethnic Nuer irrespective of their being a south Sudanese citizens, since at that time there was a dispute between Anywak and Nuer in Gambella region.

Moreover, on 27 November 2002, there was also other incident occurred in block 12 between refugees alone of Anywak and Dinka tribes, that incident has left 42 people dead from Dinka and 3 people dead from Anywak, then administration for refugee and returnees affair has interfered and solved the issue between those tribes.[74]

---

[71] Awol Yimam, empowering Sudanese refugees: save the children Sweden's work in refugees' camps of western Ethiopia, see resources center. Save the children.se/sites/default/files/document/6740.pdf, accessed on Nov 29-2016

[72] Bang Kach Ruach, Camp Chairman in Pugnido refugees camp, interviewed on Sept 15-2016

[73] Kuany Chot Kuoth, businessman in Pugnido refugees camp, interviewed on Sept 20-2016

[74] Garang Athien Deng, grade 12 student, interviewed on Sept 22-2016

Besides, refugees have also experienced subsequent attacks from the armed youth of Anywak in Gog woreda, for instance in the early first month of 2016, there were also an attacks which have loosed the lives of individuals refugees in Pugnido Refugees Camp.[75]

After all, in January 2016, an act that may also a mount to the violation of international humanitarian law has alleged to has been committed in Abobo town of the Anywak zone, at which out of 14 people of refugees who were arrested and brought to the prison administration of this town,12 people were executed in the prison by the local armed youth, so that only 2 people have escaped that execution to the bush and were collected on the next day by the Ethiopian ground force and submitted them to Pugnido Refugees Camp.[76]

Based on the aforementioned facts, my answer regarding whether there is violation of the refugees' right to life is affirmative, as it appear to me that those acts may amount to the violation of the refugees' right to life. in case of the 2nd question based on what constitute the violation of the refugees' right to life in Pugnido Refugee Camp?, by taking into consideration the interdependence and indivisibility nature of human rights, lack of the effective implementation of others rights of refugees that have direct bearing to their right to life may constitute the violation of the refugees' right to life as they are discussed below.

3.3 Right to food, health & security of person

Having in mind the fact that human rights are interdependent and indivisible, right to life is not free from that nature of human right, and therefore cannot stand independently from the below mentioned refugees' rights such as right to food, right to health and right to security, as well as

[75] Mewded Mengesha,human rights violation in refugees camps; whose responsibility to protect?, a case Ethiopia,2016 ,faculty of law, Lund University, see Lup.Lub.Lu.se/student-paper/record/8772433/files/872437.pdf,accessed on Nov 28-2016

[76] Lol Ruey Koang, former camp chairman in Pugnido refugees camp,interviewed on Oct 3-2016

may not be treated favorably to the expense of those rights of refugees that have bearing to it.

3.3.1The Right to food in Pugnido Refugee Camp

Generally, the concept of the right to food can accordingly be classified in to negative right whereby someone may obtain his food alone and the positive right where a person may be supply with food if he is unable to produce his own food due to certain circumstance beyond one's capacity.[77]

Based on this fact, as refugees are confined only to the camps with no access to other means such as land that they may use to produce their own food, the latter is the category of the refugees' right to food, as per this concept it is the obligation of the UNHCR and others co-working international organizations to fulfil the obligation of the international community toward refugees to satisfy their dietary need for food.

Here, I present what I received from the following institutions i.e. ARRA, that represent the Ethiopian government, and UNHCR. I also present a briefing received from concern worldwide, organization that supply the children with nutritional food, as well as the response from the refugees themselves as to their view about food arrangement in Pugnido Refugee Camp.

To begin with the response from ARRA to the question I put on them about how the realization of the refugees' right to food is in Pugnido Refugee Camp?, I imposed this question on camp coordinator first, he response it to me by showing to me a food distribution menu per month, at the other time I asked the same question on the programme and protection officers, they have responded it to me by submitting to me a food distribution slip, since I interview them on the food distribution day, based on their response, food arrangement in Pugnido Refugee Camp, per month is indicated by those two documents which are presented below and to be submitted in hard copy

[77] Supra note 21, Art 25

to the DMU Law School. On other hand, I have also had a discussion with UN field officer and UN protection officers regarding the realization of the refugees' right to food in Pugnido Refugee Camp, their response was the direct confirmation of the response from ARRA. According to those two documents, each refugee is entitled to monthly ration of:

1 16 kilograms of grains

1. 1.5 kilogram of pulse
2. 1.5 kilogram of famix (supplementary food)
3. 0.9 kilogram of oil
4. O.45 kilogram of sugar
5. 0.15 kilogram of consumption salt
6. 1 washing soap

According to those institutions food arrangement in Pugnido Refugee Camp is convenience and enables the refugees to realize their right to food in a manner suitable to their traditional consumption.[78]

Where as in accordance with response from concern worldwide about general food arrangement in Pugnido Refugee Camp, the organization has admitted the children from conceived one up to 5years child to have nutrition/supplementary food once a week; this program was started 2 years ago in Pugnido Refugee Camp.[79]

Regarding the response from the refugees themselves, "in fact we are receiving our ration monthly based on how it is arranged by UNHCR and ARRA, but among those food items listed on the slip, we received Rice and sugar only occasionally and that 16 kilograms of grains is only a matter of estimation, however what we would like to add is that we some time receive Sorghum, Wheat ,Maize or Rice that also create a change in food flavour,

[78] Samuel,Camp Coordinator,Stephen Borrow,protection officer of ARRA & Isac,UN field officer & Kim,UN protection officer of UNHCR officials who are responsible for refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp,interviewed on 10-20,8,2016

[79] Guog Odol Cham, Coordinator of concern worldwide,interviewed on 10-9-2016

besides in 2000 we had randomly received a cattle through communities from UNHCR moreover, in 2008 we had also randomly received a goats, that arrangement had also created a change in our living here as a refugees.[80]

After all, the food we receive monthly is not enough in that it spent only 15days while we receive our ration lately per month, as a suggestion we need the food distribution to take place on time that is either in the beginning or immediately at the end of the month.[81]

According to the above explained facts, and the reality I have gathered during my field observation, the implementation of the refugees' right to food in Pugnido refugee camp is not satisfactorily secured by the refugees in Pugnido refugee camp.

3.3.2The right to health in Pugnido Refugee Camp

As it was precisely indicated earlier under this chapter that violation of the right to health may also render the protection of the right to life meaningless unless medical care is ensured to the sick/unhealthy persons as it may be essential for preservation of the life.[82] According to this statement, right to health is the fundamental right whose guarantee and protection in favor of the refugees is necessary taking in to account the vulnerability nature of refugees in their confinement area.

On the health issue, there are 4 health centers constructed at different places with in Pugnido Refugee Camp along, these health centers provide sufficient health services to the refugees, refugees are also guaranteed with medical transfer to either Gambella or Jimma for the better medication when the need arise based on concerned situation of that infection on that refugee.[83]

[80] Supra at note 68
[81] ibid
[82] Supra at note 51
[83] Supra at note 78

Furthermore, as Pugnido Refugee Camp is known on prevalence of Malaria, a monthly supply of different types of medicine is ensured to ARRA periodically in favor of the refugees.[84]

On other hand, though officials from ARRA & UNHCR claim that health services to the refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp are sufficient to enable the refugees to enjoy their right to health as much as possible, refugees argue on other way that although there are sufficient medicine for malaria, but the main problem of the health service is such medicine are not served properly in favor of refugees, besides refugees are not provided with timely medication in case a person infected of other disease than malaria, this delay of medical aid has loosed the lives of 21 persons whose lives would not have been losed had it not been the delay of medical aid to the patients, this condition started since 2007 up to date, mostly this condition affect the women during their delivery of the children since they are losing much of their blood without timely medical aid to them, finaly,there is no great care given to the emergence cases treatment except provision of hydration water at the week end & at night time.[85]

Besides, there is no sufficient awareness about sanitation and family planning which may also contribute to the improvement of refugees' health condition, regarding the issue of family planning, there is, but majority of women do not accept it as they consider it as immoral.[86]

3.3.3The right to security in Pugnido Refugee Camp

Having in mind the interdependent nature of the human rights, right to life may not secure full enjoyment where the right to security is not guaranteed.

According to this statement, the protection of the right to life, food, health and the right to security shall be conducted simultaneously.

[84] ibid
[85] John Jock Yangdong, head nurse of health center in Pugnido Refugee Camp,interviewed on Oct 5-2016
[86] ibid

For the issue at hand, in case of the refugees' right to security in Pugnido Refugee Camp, there is a military barrack 30 minutes away from refugees' camp, plus special force and federal police in pugnido town as to the protection of refugees.[87]

However, refugees on other hand argue that even if there are troops at warehouse and there are also the federal police and special force in the pugnido Town, their operation to ensure sufficiency security in favor of refugees is not effective that is why refugees were facing insecurity.[88]

As to my field observation in Pugnido refugee camp regarding how the realization of the refugees' right to life in the camp is, refugees have a regularly distributed ration by ARRA which is supplies by WFP & UNHCR. But, the food distribution in Pugnido refugee refugee camp does not take place on time per month.

Refugees do in fact have health centers,& they do have some medicine as well specially for medication of malaria & that of T.B I have ascertain this fact when I was visiting their health centers in a multiple of times. what seems to be a little bit difficult is the issue of referral to other areas for further medication as I have observed that there was a delay on referral order that may in fact cause the lose of one's life, since some health condition needs usually urgent medication.

On the issue of refugee security, I have ascertained that there are a multiple forces for the protection of refugees in that nothing may come externally & affect them provided that these forces are in full operation, what I have also observed is that refugees may face some challenges due to negligence from their administration, except that, refugees do have fortified security forces.

[87] Stephen Borrow, ARRA protection officer in Pugnido Refugee Camp,interviewed on 20,8,2016
[88] Supra at note 72

CHAPTER FOUR

4.FINDING, CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATION

In this chapter, what is presented is what has been evaluated validly and what has been observed by the researcher personally during the field work.

4.1Findings

During the field observation period I tried to compare what I have received as a response and what I have practically observed at the field to ascertain whether the rights of refugees to life with its all associated rights such as the right to food, right to health as well as the right to security are effectively respected and protected in Pugnido refugee camp.

Regarding the refugees' right to life ,refugees' right to life is found susceptible to the violation not because there is no body to protect them but

because of the weakness of their administration, Since there are available forces deployed there for the refugees protection but as these forces receive a little operation techniques that is why refugees are facing various challenges. So as to my observation, the condition of refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp is not beyond Ethiopian government rather it seems to have been beyond their local administration.

It also appear that refugees have witnessed and acknowledged the commitment of the Ethiopian nations in general and Ethiopian government in particular to their favor in their challenged year 2006, where the Ethiopian troops were sleeping in the bush and in the refugees' camp for their protection while they were enjoying their right to life satisfactorily under the operation of their selfless coordinator Ato Tadelle Girma. After that, it seems that refugees are not enjoying their right to life satisfactorily.

About refugees' right to food, I have witnessed that refugees have some access to food regularly, since they receive their ration monthly.Besides, they do receive supplementary food from concern worldwide weekly.Moreover,refugees some times receive a variety of food ,instance, maize,sorghum,wheat & rice interchangeably based on their food arrangement.

One main condition that seem to exist in Pugnido Refugee Camp in relation to the refugees' right to food is that it appear that there are some refugees living in the camp while their ration card are made inactive by ARRA, for example I have found one woman in front of the ARRA's protection office claiming that her ration card is closed while her child was transferred to Jimma in April 2016 for medication and stayed there for 3 month with it, as the result she was reduced from the ration card with her little child. This act may violate not only the right of that woman to food but also her right to health and her right to life as well.

In case of the refugees' right to health in Pugnido Refugee Camp ,there are structurally unquestionable health centers in Pugnido Refugee Camp, besides there is also a transfer to the higher hospital for further medication when the need arise. With the respect to security issue, there are multiple forces deployed there for the protection of refugees, ranging from ground force, federal police and special force, but their operation in favor of refugees is not more effective as expected from them, as it appear that there were many incidents taken place within & outside the refugees camp while they were present there.

Generally, as to the relation between the right to food, lack of sufficiency food may either expose the refugees to deficiency disease that may in turn cause them to lose their lives, or may lead them to death directly. In case of the right to health, violation of the right to health is obvious to lead the person to death which on other hand amount to the violation of one's right to life. With the same token, violation of the right to security results to either body injured or directly to the loose of life, which without doubt entail the violation of the right to life too.

4.2 Conclusion

This senior thesis is prepared with aim to evaluate whether there is violation of the refugees' right to life in Pugnido Refugee Camp and to reveal any condition facing refugees if any so as to enable the refugees to live a normal and human life with dignity and free from fear.

Refugees as human being do have the right to life, food, health and the right to security of their persons and as such may also claim the violation of their right through the help of the law of the hosting state.

The reality of the camp life for refugees reveal that refugees' right to life is susceptible to systematic violation either directly or through the violation of the right to food, health, or the right to security.

The violation of the refugees' right to life in Pugnido refugee camp is constituted by the violation of the refugees' right to food, health, & security of their persons. As it appear that most of the refugees are vulnerable to deficiency disease due to insufficiency of food, while 21 persons have loosed their lives as the result of delay on medical aid, besides, there are more evidence which reveal that 77 peoples were missed by their families as the consequent of lack of effective security. All evidence show that right to food, health & security are intrinsic elements of the right to life & their violation may result directly or indirectly to the violation of the right to life.

4.3Recommendation

As it appear that the violation of the refugees' right to life may be constituted by the violation of others rights of refugees that have direct bearing to the right to life such as refugees' right to food, right to health and the refugees' right to security, the following recommendations are rendered:

1- Human right organizations & Ethiopian government should have their full effort to understand the reality of the camp life for refugees, In particular, food distribution should be conducted timely to serve the refugees' dietary need for food.

2- Those human right organizations should ascertain the health conditions in the camp for refugees and to improve their health services, instance to ensure the primary health care which may deal, among others, but not limited to the preventive measures among the residents of the Pugnido Refugee Camp, they should give emphasis to the mothers and child health care since they are more vulnerable to different conditions in the camps.
3- There should also be urgent transfer of medical problem which is beyond the camp level for medication to the other part of the country so as to save the life of those refugees who are in need.

4- The security of the refugees should be re-equipped so as to enable the refugees to live a confidential life in Pugnido Refugee Camp.

Bibliography

Laws

Additional Protocol to the American Convention on Human Rights in the Area of Economic, Social, & Cultural Rights, San Salvador, El Salvador, 17 November 1988

African Charter on Human & Peoples' Rights, Adopted by OAU ON 27 June 1981, Nairobi Kenya, entry into force on 21 October 1986

African Charter on the Right & the Welfare of the Child, Adopted by the Twenty-sixth Ordinary Session of the Assembly of Heads of State & Government of the OAU, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia, July 1990

African Commission on Human & peoples' Right, Kairaba Avenue, Banjul, Gambia 2000,30th Ordinary Session from 13-27 October 2001

American Declaration on the Rights & Duties of Man, Adopted by the Ninth International Conference of American States, Bogota, Colombia, 1948

Arab Charter on Human Right, Adopted by the Council of the League of Arab States on 15 September 1994,Cairo, Egypt

Cartagena Declaration on Refugees, Adopted by the Colloquium on the International protection of refugees in Central America, Mexico & Panama, held at Cartagena, Colombia from 19-22 November 1984

Charter on Fundamental Rights of the European Union,(2000/c 364/01)

Convention on the Elimination of all Forms of Discrimination against Women, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/34/180 of 18 December 1979,entry into force on 3 September 1981

Constitution of the Federal Democratic Republic of Ethiopia, Proclamation No 1/ 1995,Federal Negarit Gazeta, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Indigenous & tribal people Convention (No. 169), Adopted in Geneva, 27 June 1989, entry into force on 5 September 1991

Convention on the Protection of Human Right & Fundamental Freedoms (ETS No.5),Adopted by Council of Europe in Rome on 4 November 1950,entry into force on 3 September 1953

International Covenant on Civil & Political Rights, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/2200A (XXI) of 16 December 1966,entry into force on 23 March 1976

International convention on the elimination of all forms of racial discrimination, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/2106 (XX) of 21 December 1965, entry into force on 4 January 1969

International Covenant on Economic, Social & Cultural Rights, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/2200A (XXI) OF 16 December 1966,entry into force on 3 January 1976

Maternity protection convention (no, 183), Geneva, 15 June 2000, entry into force on 7 February 2002

Organization of African Union Convention Governing the Specific Aspect of Refugees in Africa (OAU Convention), 1969

Protocol to the African Charter on Human & Peoples' Rights on the Rights of Women in Africa, Adopted in Maputo, Mozambique, on 11 July 2003

Refugees Proclamation No 409/2004, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Second Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil & Political Rights, aiming at abolition of death penalty, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/44/128 of 15 December 1989,entry into force on July 11 1991

United Nation Convention on the Right of the Child, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/44/25 of 20 November 1989, entry into force on 2 September 1990

UN Convention on the Right of the Persons with Disabilities, Adopted by GA Resolution A/Res/61/106 of 13 December 2007

United Nation Convention Relating to the Status of Refugees & its 1967 Protocol, 1951

United Nation (1948) Universal Declaration of Human Right, adopted by UNGA Resolution A/Res/217A (III) of 10 December 1948

Vienna Declaration & Programme of Action on Human Rights, Adopted at the World Conference on Human Rights on 25 June 1993

Books

Byrne A. Garner,8th ed, Black's Law Dictionary, USA,

Darren O'Byrne,(2003) Human RIGHT on Introduction, Pearson Education Ltd New Delhi,

Debebe Hailegebriel Law Office,(2015),Ensuring Fundamental Rights, the Right to Food, Freedom of Expression, Access to Information & Reproductive Health, Addis Ababa Ethiopia,

Girmachew Alemu, Yonas Bermeta, & Wondemagegn Tadesse,(2013), Ethiopian Human Rights, School of Law & Center for Human Rights, Addis Ababa University,

Janusz Symonides,(2003),Human Rights: International Protection, Monitoring, & Enforcement, University of Warsaw, Poland,

Martin Dixon, 4th ed, (2000), Text Book on International Law, Oxford University Press,

Sunil Deshta, & Kiran Deshta 2nd ed (2007),Fundamental Human Right, Faculty of Law, H.P University ,Shimla, New Delhi.

Internet sources

Asylum & the rights of refugees/ international justice Resource Center, see at http://www.ijrcenter.org/refugees law/accessed on Oct 28-2016

Awol Yimam, Empowering Sudanese Refugees: Save the Children Sweden's work in Refugees camps of Western Ethiopia; see at resources center, save the children.se/sites/default/files/document/6740.pdf,accessed on Nov 29-2016

Erika Feller, Evolution of the International Refugees Protection Regimes, see at http://www.law.wustle.edu/haris/document/p129-feller.pdf. Nov 2-2016

Ethiopia-WorldFactBook-CentralIntelligenceAgency,seeat http://www.cia.gov/library/publication, accessed on Dec 01-2016

International Committee of the Red Cross, see at http://www.icrc.org/eng/assete/files/other/728-738-jaeger.pdf,accessed on Oct 29-2016

Jean Ziegler,(2002), United Nation Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food, see at www.fao.org/right-to-food/about-right to food-/en, accessed on Oct 21-2016

Mewded Mengesha, (2016) Human Right Violations in Refugees Camps: Whose Responsibility to Protect? A case in Ethiopia, Faculty of law, Lund University, see at Lup.Lub.Lu.se/student-paper/record/8772433/files/8772437.pdf, accessed on Nov 28-2016

Misganaw Gashaw, Food as Human Right: The Frontier of the Ethiopian Government Obligation, Articles,(published), Debremarkos University,

Module3: Water, Sanitation, & Housing in Refugees Camps, see at www.unitedforsight.org/refugees health/module3,accessed on Nov 11-2016

Natalie Robert, Medicine saint frontier(MSF) Medical Coordinator in Gambella for Refugees ,Ethiopia :critical Conditions for South Sudanese Refugees in Gambella ,see at www.msf.org/en/articles/Ethiopia-critical-conditions-south Sudanese -refugees-Gambella, accessed on Dec 02-2016

Refugees Global Footprints, see at http://www.globalfootprints.org/refugees,accessed on Nov 9-2016

Refugee Law & Guiding Principles on Internal Displacement, see at http://www.unhcr.org/international-refugees agency, accessed on Oct 30-2016

Right to Life- Wikipedia, see at http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/right -to-life, accessed on Nov 13-2016

Right to life in the world/Humanism-together for children's right to life, see at www.humanism.org/.../right-to-life/accessed on Nov 26-2016

South Sudan Situation-Ethiopia-Gambella, see at www. Data.unhcr.org/south Sudan/region, php?id=36 & country=65, accessed on Oct 30-2016

Understanding Children's Right to Food/Humanism-together for Children's Rights, see at www.humanism.org/en/fundamental/right/food/accessed on Nov 21-2016

United Nation High Commissioner for Refugees, sees at http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/united-nation-high-commis-for-refugees,accessed on Nov 3-2016

United Nation High Commissioner for Refugees see at www.unhcr.org/54f6b129.pdf,accessed on Oct 27-2016

Interviewees

Officials representing the refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp

Samuel, Camp Coordinator under ARRA in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 15, 8, 2016

Stephen Borrow, protection officer under ARRA in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 20, 8, 2016

Isaac, UN Field Officer in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 10, 8, 2016

Kim, UN Protection Officer in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 18, 8, 2016

Guog Odol Cham, Coordinator of Concern Worldwide in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 10, 9, 2016

Selected Refugees

Bang Kach Ruach, Camp Chairman in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 15, 9, 2016

Kuany Chot Kuoth, Businessman in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 20, 9, 2016

Garang Athien Deng, grade 12 student in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 22, 9, 2016

Lol Ruey Koang, Former Camp Chairman in Pugnido Refugee Camp, interviewed on 3,10,2016

John Jock Yangdong, Head nurse in Pugnido Refugee Camp's higher health center, interviewed on 5,10,2016

Annex

DOCUMENTARY EVIDENCES

4.2.1 Food distribution menu & slip

4.2.2 Interview questions for some selected refugees & officials responsible with refugees administration in Pugnido refugee camp

Interview Guides for both Refugees & Officials Responsible for the administration of Refugees

Sex

Age

Marital status

Educational level if any

Occupation if any

Position if any

A. Interview questions for Refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp

1 How is the living condition with you in Pugnido Refugee Camp?

1 How do you enjoy the services provided to you such as food supply, water supply & other related services?
2 How is your interaction with the local peoples?
3 For how long you have lived in Pugnido Refugee Camp?
4 How do you describe the camp life in comparison with your life before you came here?
5 What have you faced or enjoyed after you have entered into Ethiopia?
6 When have you come to Pugnido Refugee Camp?
7 Why do you choose to live in Refugee Camp?
8 Are you interesting to continue living in Pugnido Refugee Camp?
9 How you enjoy the health services provided to you by ARRA & UNHCR?
10 What are/is the dominant disease affecting your health conditions here?
11 Is there surgery services provided to you in your health centers?

B.Interview questions for the officials institutions responsible for refugee administration in Pugnido refugee camp, specifically Concern Worldwide.

1 What are the services provided by Concern Worldwide to the refugees community?

2 when did the Concern Worldwide started the provision of services to the refugees in Pugnido Refugee Camp?

1.